pli-tv-bu-vb-pc81 — Criticizing a robe distribution

English translation by Bhikkhu Brahmali.
Source: https://suttacentral.net/pli-tv-bu-vb-pc81/en/brahmali
Source revision: 6a395ceb6f28549111d7d96859f7f6f6610afc01
License: CC0-1.0 — https://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/

Text

Theravāda Collection on Monastic Law

The Great Analysis

The chapter on offenses entailing confession

The subchapter on legitimate correction

Criticizing a robe distribution

Origin story

At one time when the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, Venerable Dabba the Mallian, who was the assigner of dwellings and the designator of meals, had a robe that was worn out. Just then the Sangha had obtained a robe, which it gave to Dabba. The monks from the group of six complained and criticized it, “The monks are diverting the Sangha’s material support according to friendship.”

The monks of few desires complained and criticized them, “How could the monks from the group of six give out a robe as part of a unanimous Sangha and then criticize it afterwards?” … “Is it true, monks, that you did this?”

“It’s true, sir.”

The Buddha rebuked them … “Foolish men, how could you do this? This will affect people’s confidence …” … “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘If a monk gives out a robe as part of a unanimous Sangha and then criticizes it afterwards, saying, “The monks are diverting the Sangha’s material support according to friendship,” he commits an offense entailing confession.’”

Definitions

A: whoever … Monk: … The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case. A unanimous Sangha: belonging to the same Buddhist sect and staying within the same monastery zone. A robe: one of the six kinds of robe-cloth, but not smaller than what can be assigned to another. Gives out: gives out himself. According to friendship: according to friendship, according to companionship, according to who one is devoted to, according to being a

co-student, according to being a co-pupil. The Sangha's: given to the Sangha, given up to the Sangha. Material support: robes, almsfood, a dwelling, and medicinal supplies; even a bit of bath powder, a tooth cleaner, or a piece of string. Criticizes it afterwards: when robe-cloth has been given to someone who is fully ordained and who is the assigner of dwellings or the designator of meals or the distributor of congee or the distributor of fruit or the distributor of fresh foods or the distributor of minor requisites, and he has been appointed by the Sangha as such, then if a monk criticizes the giving, he commits an offense entailing confession.

Permutations

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, and he criticizes the giving of robe-cloth, he commits an offense entailing confession. If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, and he criticizes the giving of robe-cloth, he commits an offense entailing confession. If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as illegitimate, and he criticizes the giving of robe-cloth, he commits an offense entailing confession.

If he criticizes the giving of another requisite, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. When robe-cloth or another requisite has been given to someone who is fully ordained and who is the assigner of dwellings or the designator of meals or the distributor of congee or the distributor of fruit or the distributor of fresh foods or the distributor of minor requisites, but he has not been appointed by the Sangha as such, then if a monk criticizes the giving, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. When robe-cloth or another requisite has been given to someone who is not fully ordained and who is the assigner of dwellings or the designator of meals or the distributor of congee or the distributor of fruit or the distributor of fresh foods or the distributor of minor requisites, whether he has been appointed by the Sangha as such or not, then if a monk criticizes the giving, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as legitimate, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, there is no offense.

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he criticizes one who regularly acts out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, or fear, saying, "What's the point of giving it to him—he'll ruin it or use it inappropriately;" if he is insane; if he is the first offender.

The training rule on criticizing a robe distribution, the eleventh, is finished.